

Internal Report on the Quality of the Project Implementation

ERASMUS+: Project 561775-EPP-1-2015-1-DE-EPPKA2-CBHE-JP
Trans-Regional Environmental Awareness for Sustainable Usage of Water Resources
(TREASURE-WATER)

Presented by the Trans-Institutional Quality Assurance Group (TIQAG)
At the project concluding conference, 19-22 August, ENU Branch at Almaty, Kazakhstan
20.08.2019

Members of the Quality Trans-institutional Working Group (TWG) : Prof. E. Wagner (ALU), Dr. G. Telegina (TyuSU), Dr. H.Skoulikaris (AUTH), Dr. A. Economou-Amilli (UA), Dr. B. Krasnoyarova (IWEPE), Dr. R. Beisenova (ENU); Dr. B. Medeubaeva (EKSU), Dr. D. Verschinin (TSU), Dr. T. Antyufeeva (ASU), Dr. O. Baryschnykova (ASU), Dr. E. Zarov (YuSU)

Introduction

The TWG on the Quality issues of the project TREASURE-WATER have analysed the processes of the project implementation and the results achieved by the consortium by the date of the concluding conference (20.08.2019) and taking into account the final events planned for the last 2 months before the end of the project (15.10.2019). The purpose of the evaluation has been to assess the progress and the outputs/outcomes of the project against the planned in the original proposal indicators, following the logic of the work packages, as presented in the LFM.

The results of the report are to be presented at the final conference, to allow the partners to take a few measures if necessary to respond to the comments and criticisms, if any.

Planned Outputs (tangible) and Outcomes (intangible)	Planned Indicators of progress	Factual Results	Degree of Fulfilment	Comments
<p>WP 1. Preparatory measures for the start-up of the project</p> <p>1.1. Legal framework of the consortium 1.2. The kick-off of the project 1.3. Formation of the Interdisciplinary Working Groups (IWG)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Legal framework of the consortium 12 partnership agreements; • Staff for IWG-s selected; • The introductory meeting of the consortium; • 10 cooperation agreements 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A Multilateral Partnership Agreement signed between all consortium members; • Working groups (WG) of 2 types set up: institutional and trans-institutional WGs, each centred around a task in WPs. Meetings of IWG-s at the PC HEI-s 13 01.-28.02.2016 (44 persons). • 33 participants; • 22 cooperation agreements (16 international and 6 on the national level); 	<p>Achieved</p> <p>Achieved</p> <p>Achieved</p> <p>Achieved 220%</p>	
<p>WP 2. Design of methodology for TWRM and strategy for IALP building</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2.1. A knowledge pool for TWRM created • 2.2. Methodology for TWRM developed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4 data bases on TWRM created; • A report on the PC-s' needs available; • A concept of modern approaches to TWRM outlined; • IALP round tables organized • equipment purchased 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 6 data bases available on the the depository e-platform (DEP): https://public.edu.asu.ru/course/index.php?categoryid=23An • Report on the PC-s' needs and the on-line information resources available on DEP; • A 'puzzle catalogue' of relevant courses compiled; • Strategy for Industry-Academia Learning Partnerships outlined (PW, DEP); • Guidelines for good practices developed and circulated (PW, DEP). • Statistics on the users of the data bases; • Best Practices Guidelines for interaction with industry available; reports 	<p>Achieved 150%</p> <p>Achieved</p> <p>Achieved</p> <p>Achieved</p>	

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2.3.Strategy for interaction with industry designed 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • on round tables n the project website (PW); • A Competence Matrix designed (DEP) • 27 Syllabi of courses available in English • The TWRM-specific FQ (Level 7 of EQF) developed 	<p>Over 120 users</p> <p>Reports on 14 'round tables' with over 80 external stakeholders</p>	
<p>WP 3.'Industry-Academia Teaching Task Force' (IATTF) created</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3.1.Academic staff from the PC universities and industry trained • 3.2.Teaching environment at PC institutions modernised 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 66 staff trained in the EU, 122 – in the PCs; • 4 e-learning labs equipped 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 243 participants for the IATTF trained: 89 in the EU; 154 locally; • 6 e-learning labs/resource units equipped 	<p>Achieved 130%</p> <p>Achieved 150%</p>	
<p>WP 4.The curricula and courses in TWRM for training of industry partners designed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4.1.The syllabi and course plans agreed and confirmed • 4.2. ECTS based courses developed/ modernized • 4.3.A digital library of course materials created 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 12 new curricula for prof. development; • 24 new courses with supporting teaching materials developed; • 12 modules adapted for blended learning; • The new materials published and digitalized 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 13 curricula ECTS-based professional. development training courses for industry (level 7 of the EQF) designed in the e-format; • A joint pool of 92 modules available for blended learning • Project reports with agreed curricula changes from the partners involved; • 27 modules adapted for blended learning; • A user guide on the e-platform; 	<p>Achieved 130%</p>	<p>The numbers of developed modules (92) is equivalent to 30-40 courses, depending on the ECTS 'weight' of the modules.</p>

<p>WP 5. An e-learning interactive capacity developed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 5.1.The e-learning platform designed and installed • 5.2. User manuals prepared • 5.3. The academic content developed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Open access to the online teaching/learning resources and databases; • 12 modules adapted for distance learning; • user guides developed • the e-learning platform and the data bases updated 4 times a year 	<p>A new inter-instituional platform for BL course delivery designed: http://moodle.treasure-water.ru; A user manual for the e-learning platform available online: https://public.edu.asu.ru/course/index.php?categoryid=23An</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Over 600 users of the online-platforms • The e-learning platform and the data bases regularly updated 	<p>Achieved</p>	
<p>WP 6. Implementation of the training courses on TWRM</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 6.1.Training courses for industry partners in operation 6.2.The TWRM modules integrated into post-graduate curricula at PC universites 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The courses for industry partners are running; • 24 new courses in operation • 12 modules adapted for distance learning; • MSc programs enriched with WTRM modules; • 10 cooperation agreements between HEIs and enterprises 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training courses for external stakeholders fully in operation: 19 training events, 359 trainees. • 50% of the modules integrated into curricula at PCIs • 5 positive quality reports by industry representatives; • 1 peer review (Kazakh National Research Institute for Fishery) 	<p>Achieved</p>	
<p>WP 7. Efficient Quality control and monitoring of the project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 project reports to the EACEA • 12 intermediary institutional reports • 12 management meetings • Individual mobility reports of staff and students; • Documents of the course evaluation; • The external audit report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 project reports to the EACEA • 8 Intermediary internal quality monitoring reports (included in the protocols of the QualityTWG and coordination meetings) available on PW and DEP; • 12 intermediary institutional reports; • 14 management meetings • 89 individual mobility reports of staff; • 5 positive quality reports by industry representative; • 1 peer review (Kazakh National Research Institute for Fishery) • 2 internal quality evaluation reports • The external audit report • An External Quality Evaluation Report 	<p>Achieved 120%</p>	<p>2 Extra coordinating meetings held due to efficient use of the budget; Intermediary institutional reports available in Russian</p>

<p>WP 8. Successful dissemination is achieved</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 links per partner country to the resource from intranet or websites of other HEIs • Numbers of dissemination materials; • 400 target users to be contacted during project; • Reports on conferences and seminars. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 mirrored project websites created at the EU (ALU) and PC (TyuSU) coordinating institutions: http://treasure-water.eu/; https://www.utmn.ru/riic/eng/eu-projects/erasmus/ • Strategy for dissemination developed; • Project report on dissemination; • Over 600 users of the project websites; • 8 institutional websites at the PC institutions; http://www.geo.asu.ru/sci_geo/erasmus/ http://ggf.tsu.ru/content/actual/detail.php?ID=2224 http://ggf.tsu.ru/content/faculty/structure/chair/hydrology/project-erasmus-/ https://ugrasu.ru/international-activities/erasmus-.php https://www.vkgu.kz/ru/page/mezhdunarodnye-nauchnye-proekty.html http://www.enu.kz/ru/sotrudnichestvo/tempus/ http://www.iwep.ru/ru/relationship/Erasmus.html http://www.vodokanal.info/ 	<p>Achieved 120%</p>	<p>The websites to be maintained by partners from own resources</p> <p>The concluding conference held at ENU</p>
<p>WP 9. Efficient Management of the project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 12 management meetings • 12 intermediary institutional reports • Annual reviews of the project implementation; • The interim and final reports to EC 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 14 project coordination meetings. • 18 IWG meetings • Agendas of 12 workshops; • Protocols of 14 management meetings; (DEP, PW) • Documentation archives; • The external audit report; • An External Quality Evaluation Report (PW) • Reports of the inter-project coaching (PW) 	<p>Achieved 110%</p>	

Conclusions

The analysis of the projects deliverables against the planned outcomes and outputs has allowed to conclude, that despite the initial delay in finalising the multilateral partnership agreement which hampered the grant transfers to partners, the project overall has fulfilled all the planned activities and has achieved the planned results. The consortium has made a serious effort to respond to the criticisms from the monitoring bodies and has improved its formal instruments, in particular in terms of formalizing the strategies for quality assurance, management and dissemination. The key documents in these dimensions (strategies, plans and reports) have been further developed and practically applied. Due to the efficient management of the budget and the prolongation granted, in a number of work packages the outcomes have exceeded the originally planned. The analysis of the feedback from the project participants and the target groups allows us to conclude that the project has succeeded in achieving its goal: to contribute to empowering of HEIs in Russia and Kazakhstan by enhancing synergy between Higher Education and enterprises in the field of trans-boundary water resources management (TWRM) and by enhancing teaching capacities of the PC HEIs and developing instruments for interaction between HEIs and enterprises.