



## Report

### on Comparative Analysis of Quality Assurance and Quality Management of Educational Product in Professional Development System

*In the Report, the main legislation documents regulating educational services provision in Russia and Kazakhstan are considered in a comparative aspect. The key similarities and difference are analysed in the forms and instruments of internal and external quality monitoring of training courses, quantitative parameters of the courses, their forms and official languages of delivery and assessment, types of service providers and learning outcomes control.*

1. The provision of additional vocational education services in Russia and Kazakhstan is guaranteed by the laws of the respective states "On Education"

- Federal law of the Russian Federation *On Education* dated 29 December 2012 N 273-ФЗ;

- Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan *On Education* dated 27 July 2007 No. 319-III (with amendments and annexes as of 09 April 2016).

The rules and procedures for the provision of the above-mentioned services are regulated

- in the Russian Federation by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation dated 01 July 2013 N 499 "On Approving the Procedure for the Organization and Implementation of Educational Activity for Further Professional Programmes";
- in the Republic of Kazakhstan by the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 11 September 2013 No. 370 "On Approval of the Model Regulations for the Organizations of Further Education for Adults' Activities".

2. The countries are participants in the AGREEMENT on cooperation in the field of professional development and professional retraining of specialists of the Commonwealth of Independent States members".

The agreement determines uniform concepts for all participating countries and a minimum credit value in academic hours, which facilitates mutual control and mutual recognition of documents on the appropriate form of further professional education.

The discrepancy between academic value within one credit unit (1 credit) in the education systems of Kazakhstan, Russia and the European Union does not allow estimating the credit value of joint further education programmes or transferring in a unified credit system, as is customary in the EU. In Russia, one credit corresponds to 36 academic hours, in Kazakhstan - 45 academic hours, in the EU - 30 academic hours. Therefore, in the interstate agreements and in the programmes of further education created in the framework of the current joint project in the field of transboundary water use, the main evaluation criterion of academic value is the duration of studies expressed in academic hours.

Accordingly:

**Professional development of specialists** stands for implementation of further professional educational programmes aimed at expanding, deepening and improving previously acquired professional expertise, knowledge and skills, lasting no less than two full academic weeks, or 72 academic hours of contact teaching, completing in the final attestation;

**Professional retraining of specialists** stands for the implementation of further professional educational programmes lasting at least two full terms, or 1000 academic hours of contact teaching, not leading to a change in the previously achieved level of education and completing in the final attestation and the appropriation of a new professional qualification.

At the same time, in Russia and Kazakhstan, there apply internal standards for minimum credit value of forms of further professional education and the load of credits (credit units). So in Russia, documents (a certificate of development) on the completion of development courses can be issued with a duration of 16 hours or more (this is 0.53 credits in ECTS); retraining programmes should have a duration of at least 250 hours (8.3 ECTS), after completion, a diploma of retraining is issued.

In Kazakhstan, the minimum duration of development courses and retraining programmes is the same as prescribed in the "Agreement" (2.4 and 33.3, ECTS credits respectively), at the end of the development courses a certificate of development is given, after the successful completion of the retraining programme a certificate of retraining is issued.

Additional educational services are delivered in the Russian Federation in Russian, in the Republic of Kazakhstan in the Kazakh and Russian languages, while in both countries, if necessary, teaching in English is allowed. However, the documents are issued only in state languages.

3. The evaluation of the quality of the development of further professional programmes is conducted in relation to:

- 1) Conformity of the results of a further professional programme to the declared goals and planned results of training;
- 2) Conformity of the further professional programme organization and implementation to the established requirements for the structure, procedure and conditions for the realization of the programmes;
- 3) Ability of the organization to efficiently and effectively provide the educational services.

The evaluation of the quality of the development of additional professional programmes is carried out in the following forms:

1) Internal monitoring. In higher education institutions of Russia and Kazakhstan, internal monitoring is carried out directly by the units that carry out this type of educational activity: Centres for retraining (further vocational education), Institutes and other units that have the right to this type of activity in accordance with the laws on education of each country. In addition, universities have educational / methodological councils / commissions, departments / departments for quality control of educational services, educational and methodical departments usually subordinate to the Vice-rector for educational / educational activities, and who are required to monitor the conformity of educational products implemented in their universities with the current regulatory documents. They determine forms of assessment of the quality of knowledge and skills of students, forms of the final certification, appoint a commission to assess the level of competence.

2) External assessment. At the stage of formation of educational programmes for development and retraining, external control is carried out through the participation of employers in the development of curricula and courses, the formation of demand for certain knowledge and skills; involvement in the training process of specialists having experience of professional activity in the relevant sectors of the economy; national, regional, industrial framework of competencies.

At the stage of implementation of educational programmes, control is also carried out by enterprise managers and by the students themselves, through feedback on the programme, recommendations to other people involved, requests for new educational products in accordance with current needs.

Moreover, organizations on a voluntary basis can apply procedures of an independent assessment of the quality of education, professional public accreditation of further professional programmes and public accreditation of organizations.

The main criteria for assessing the quality of educational activities of organizations that carry out educational activities are the following: the level of satisfaction with the material and technical support of the organization; the level of satisfaction with the quality of the educational services provided and the degree of their conformity to the expectations of the stakeholders; readiness to recommend the services of this organization to other people.

Conclusion. Further vocational education in the CIS countries has a long history of joint development and currently retains a certain continuity; therefore, the structure of quality management and control in Russian and Kazakhstan universities does not differ significantly.

Programmes of further training in both countries are delivered by both public and private organizations that are licensed to conduct this activity. Personnel retraining programmes undergo a licensing procedure; nationally recognised documents are issued upon completion of development courses and retraining programmes.

In Russia and Kazakhstan, experts in relevant fields of knowledge with vocational experience participate in the organization and control of the quality of the educational process. Specialists can take part both in the training process as trainers, teachers, supervisors of scientific work or practice, and as external auditors of programmes for development and retraining of personnel.

In both countries, the participants themselves or heads of organizations interested in developing certain competencies for their employees take part in composition of professional development programmes. That is, development programmes are tailored in account with the customers' expectations and requirements.